



Front Line - Bottom Line

Estimating the Annual Cost of Domestic Violence in the
Community of Thompson, Manitoba

**Project design by:
Joy A Thompson. Thompson, Manitoba**

Table of Contents



Letter to MAPS	3
Summary	4
Recommendations	9
Introduction	10
Methodology	12
Introduction to Consultation Findings	16
Global Costs	19
Scenarios – Costs Add Up	27
References and Sources	36

Letter to MAPS



Board of Directors
MAPS
90 Princeton Drive
Thompson, Manitoba
R8N 0L3

June 5, 2012

Dear Board Members:

This project could not have been completed without the support of the Chair of the Board of Directors, Oswald Sawh and the Program Director, Michele Nichol; and the participation of MAPS board members.

I would like to thank the many stakeholders who provide services to Thompson residents affected by the tragedy of domestic violence. They gave generously of their time and expertise to make this cost analysis of intimate partner abuse in the community of Thompson possible.

The findings of this project illustrate that more humane, preventive and holistic responses to the wide-spread problem of intimate partner abuse in Thompson are highly cost effective.

Thank you for the opportunity to develop this exciting and interesting project.

I hope this report will be effective in bringing attention to the issue of domestic violence in Thompson, Manitoba.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Joy A. Thompson".

Joy A Thompson
Consultant to MAPS

Summary

The Thompson Urban Aboriginal Strategy (TUAS) provided funding for this project to Men Are Part of the Solution (MAPS), a non-profit organization located in Thompson, Manitoba that provides support, counseling, and education to men who want to improve their relationships with their intimate partners and families.

- The goals of this project are to answer the following questions:

how many people in Thompson are affected by domestic violence; how many are using services; how much of these services are they using; and how much are these services and interventions costing?

For the purposes of this report domestic violence is defined as intimate partner abuse and these terms are used interchangeably.

To our knowledge, this is the first time that an analysis of the cost of domestic violence in Manitoba, or a specific community such as Thompson has been attempted. Numerous estimates of the cost of intimate partner abuse have been conducted in Canada and elsewhere and all stress that the costs they can quantify are incomplete and likely under estimate the total cost to society of this complex problem.

During the consultation process the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP) - Thompson Detachment reported that they had handled 176 “strictly domestic violence” cases in 2011. Manitoba’s mandatory arrest policy for domestic violence, known as *Zero Tolerance*, suggests that charges were laid in all of these cases.

We know from numerous studies that only 22% of incidents of intimate partner abuse are reported to police. Therefore, we can extrapolate that, at the very least, there were **800 incidents of “strictly domestic violence” in Thompson in 2011.**

Factors that increase the likelihood of domestic violence such as; living in a common-law union verses a legal marriage and raising children in blended

verses in-tact families increase the risk of intimate partner abuse. Also, young couples between the ages of 25 – 34 and Aboriginal women are more likely to experience intimate partner abuse. Thompson’s population includes higher percentages of residents with all of these risk factors than the Manitoba averages, significantly increasing the prevalence, severity, and the impact of domestic violence.

Thompson, Manitoba – Estimated Annual Incidents of Intimate Partner Abuse

The most conservative estimate of intimate partner abuse incidents in 2011 in Thompson is a staggering 800.

Minimum Estimated Selected Annual Global Cost of Intimate Partner Abuse in Thompson

Estimated Annual Global Costs	
Justice	\$1,550,549
Health Services	\$559,475
Domestic Violence Specific Services	\$1,021,712
Child and Family Services	\$589,607
Other Social Services	\$139,125
Education	\$129,180
TOTAL	\$3,989,648

Given that no cost analysis of intimate partner abuse can be complete; this estimate includes only those selected costs that can be quantified.

The actual cost of domestic violence in Thompson is significantly higher than the costs itemized in this report.

Two hypothetical intimate partner incidents scenarios are also presented in this report. These scenarios reflect the range of resources expended to respond to intimate partner abuse and illustrate the complexity and scope of services and interventions in Thompson.

High Intensity, High Cost Scenario Steve and Shelley	
Perpetrator	\$62,857
Survivor and child witnesses	\$67,144
TOTAL	\$130,001

Early Intervention, Treatment Focused, Low Cost Scenario Kevin and Kate	
Perpetrator	\$5,645
Survivor and child witness	\$11,462
TOTAL	\$17,107

If all 176 incidents handled by the RCMP – Thompson Detachment in 2011 utilized these resources the high-intensity, high-cost scenario would cost

\$22,880,176. The early intervention, treatment focused, low-cost scenario by comparison would cost **\$3,010,832.** These scenarios demonstrate that when abusers take responsibility for their behavior and access treatment, early intervention is highly cost effective. The high-intensity scenario is estimated to cost **nearly twenty million dollars more** than the early intervention, treatment focused scenario.

The cyclical and escalating dynamics of intimate partner abuse, and the known increased risk of injury to survivors when they try to leave an abusive relationship, must always be the priority when determining safe, appropriate and effective services and interventions.

The impact of domestic violence on the lives of the women, children and men impacted can't be quantified in economic terms only. The personal consequences of intimate partner abuse ripple across every sector of society, and have life-long impact on survivors, their children and abusers.

Third party costs to individuals such as loss of income and out-of-pocket expenses are not included in this estimate. Although it was not possible to include an estimate of the cost of fear, pain, personal devastation and the loss of quality of life in this cost analysis, the human suffering caused by domestic violence is devastating and has tremendous economic consequences.

It was alarming to hear from stakeholders in Thompson that as many as **80% of their clients experience domestic violence and that as much as 33% of staff time was spent in providing services and interventions related to intimate partner abuse.** These anecdotal estimates establish that intimate partner abuse is a wide-spread problem that consumes enormous resources across all service sectors in Thompson.

Thompson is a community struggling to get to grips with violent crime. One of the few Statistics Canada reports that isolates Thompson data is the annually published *Juristat Crime Severity Index*. This report provides a rating for each policing community over 10,000 in population in Canada. **Thompson was rated 1st in Canada for violent crime severity in both the 2010 and 2011 reports and rated 2nd in overall crime severity for three consecutive years, 2009, 2010, and 2011.**

The intergenerational devastation of colonization with its destructive impact on Aboriginal peoples and communities is a wide-spread reality in Thompson, Manitoba. Too many of Thompson's Aboriginal residents are survivors of violence. Stakeholders in Thompson said that many of their clients were both abuser and survivor interchangeably.

It is hoped that the intermediate and long term results of these findings will bring more pro-active, holistic and humane solutions to better address the issue of domestic violence in Thompson. The safety and security of Thompson's population and the commitment of its residents to create a violence-free, caring community will help to facilitate positive changes.

Policy makers are also called upon to join with the community in addressing this tragic and costly problem. Every level of government and every sector of the community need to make a commitment to support families healing from past abuse.

This report will be provided to the Thompson Urban Aboriginal Strategy and made available to stakeholders who gave of their expertise during the consultation process.

Recommendations



Stakeholders and clients of service providers interviewed during the consultation made the following recommendations for improving services in Thompson; in particular they stressed increasing options for abusers who are so often survivors of abuse themselves.

1. More public resources should be dedicated to services and treatment for people with abusive behaviors to reduce the current wait times for individuals who want to change their abusive behaviors.
2. Culturally based programming for Aboriginal people should be adequately resourced so that Aboriginal families can heal their past experiences of abuse.
3. Options for reducing the number of trials involving criminal charges related to intimate partner abuse should be resourced adequately such as; the Domestic Violence Treatment Option Court model currently being piloted in Thompson and the Domestic Violence Court in North Battleford, Saskatchewan.
4. Domestic violence related cases heard in Thompson courts should be consistently identified on court dockets and a system for segregating domestic violence related data should be developed so that more accurate information about the number of charges, pleas, convictions, and repeat offenders can be compiled.
5. More investment into programs and approaches that increase youth competence to build healthy intimate relationships will reap long-term benefits to individuals and interrupt the intergenerational cycle of intimate partner abuse.
6. Employment and Income Assistance should waive the one-time limitation for community start-up grants and tenant's damage deposits so that survivors and their children are eligible for assistance to secure a violence-free home.
7. Short-term treatment based Interim Housing for men with abusive behaviors should be established in Thompson. Requirements for program eligibility should include counseling participation contracts.

Introduction



It has been suggested that Northern Manitoba has one of the highest rates of domestic violence in Canada. In the past, social agencies have argued that there is a need for more proactive, preventive and holistic programs to address this issue on a grass roots basis (i.e. counseling for perpetrators in combination and/or opposed to incarceration, more services for men with abusive behaviors, more long-term supports for survivors and their children who are trying to build violence-free lives, and more interventions to interrupt the intergenerational cycle of domestic violence). The argument has always been that the cost to society of maintaining the status quo is much higher than the cost of implementing proactive and preventive programs.

Spousal abuse has enormous economic implications for Canadian society. One of the first research studies in Canada to estimate the cost of violence against women, including abuse in intimate relationships, found that this complex social problem costs Canadian society an estimated \$4.2 billion a year in social services, education, criminal justice, labour, employment, health and medical costs.

Thompson is the largest city in Northern Manitoba and is considered the “hub of Northern Manitoba”. *Statistics Canada: 2011 Census* reports Thompson’s population as 12,829. The City of Thompson believes the population to be significantly higher due to the large numbers of people who stay in Thompson for extended periods of time from outlying communities. Although outlying communities in Northern Manitoba bear a burden of cost associated with domestic violence, this cost analysis focuses on the City of Thompson, where rural residents access services and institutions such as courts, hospitals, crisis and health services.

Statistics Canada: *Family Violence in Canada: A Statistical Profile 2010* reported that in 2009 Canadians aged 25 to 34 were three times more likely to report being physically or sexually assaulted by a current spouse. 15.39% of the 2006 Thompson population of 13,446 were between the ages of 25 and 34, compared to the Manitoba average of 12.275%. Spousal violence in common-law relationships was also reported to be three times more likely than for married couples. 37.144% of couples in Thompson live in common-law relationships, compared to the Manitoba average of 14.926%.

Statistics Canada also reported in *Violent Victimization of Aboriginal Women in Canadian Provinces, 2010* that in 2009 Aboriginal women in Canada were more likely to state that they had been a victim of spousal violence. 15% reported being victims of spousal violence within the previous five years compared to 6% of Non-Aboriginal women.

Given the demographic profile of Thompson we can assume there are many more than 800 incidents of intimate partner abuse in Thompson every year.

Compounding these risk factors is the relative isolation of Thompson. Access to services and increased options for women, men and children facilitate personal resilience and create a “safety net” which provides a “buffer” that can reduce the negative impact of domestic violence. Unlike urban centres in southern Manitoba, Thompson has less general and specialized support and intervention services, and individuals have less access to social capital.

Methodology



In order to encompass the comprehensive and multi-layered challenges faced by individuals and families struggling with intimate partner abuse in Thompson, Manitoba, MAPS determined that community stakeholder consultations with a broad range of representatives from social services, educational services, health services and justice was required.

MAPS invited key stakeholders to a project introduction meeting in December, 2011. An invitation to participate in the project was also presented to a committee of community and legal leaders involved in an initiative to create a Domestic Violence Treatment Option Court in Thompson.

MAPS engaged a consultant who contacted organizations, government programs, and institutions that provide services and interventions to abusers, survivors and their children and invited community leaders and experts on the issue of domestic violence to participate in the consultation.

All initial invitees were asked to provide further contacts of people who could provide relevant information. The consultant visited the community of Thompson four times to interview stakeholders, conducted interviews in Winnipeg and by telephone; and received submissions in writing.

Participants provided invaluable information during the consultation. Front-line professionals such as lawyers, counselors, therapists, adult educators and specialized domestic violence service providers generously gave of their time and expertise. Some stakeholders who did not participate in interviews directed the consultant to relevant data and information in the public domain.

In addition, in partnership with the two chief domestic violence service organizations in Thompson, confidential individual interviews were conducted with both abusers and survivors to listen to their experiences and ask what additional resources would help them and their families.

Participant Stakeholders

- **Chair and Program Director, Men Are Part of the Solution**
- **Domestic Violence Treatment Option Court Committee**
- **Family Therapist, Burntwood Regional Health Authority, Community Health Action Centre**
- **Aboriginal Outreach, Burntwood Regional Health Authority, Community Health Action Centre**
- **Thompson Crisis Centre**
- **Victims Services, Manitoba**
- **RCMP, Thompson Detachment**
- **The Honorable Judge, Brian Colli**
- **Crown Council, Prosecutor**
- **Legal Aid Manitoba, Staff Lawyer**
- **Addiction Foundation of Manitoba, Thompson**
- **University of Winnipeg, Student Services**
- **Children and Family Services, General Authority, Northern Region**
- **Awasis Agency of Northern Manitoba**
- **Métis Child and Family Services**
- **Manitoba Metis Federation (Justice Program)**
- **Probation Services, Thompson**
- **YWCA, Thompson**
- **Family Conciliation Program, Community Service Delivery Division, Thompson, Manitoba**
- **University of Manitoba, Northern School of Social Work,**
- **Homeless Shelter, Thompson**
- **Ma-Mow-We-Tak Friendship Centre**
- **Marymound, Futures Program, Thompson**
- **School District of Mystery Lake**
- **Four current clients of domestic violence services in Thompson.**

Individual and group interviews were conducted by the consultant and tailored to the specific program or service. Depending on the service category, additional specific questions were posed; however all participants were asked:

- **What percentage of your organization/program staff time is spent on the issue of domestic violence?**
- **What percentage of your clients do you think struggle with the issue of intimate partner abuse?**
- **Do you think there are gaps in services and interventions?**
- **What services/interventions do you think are needed to better address the problem of intimate partner abuse among your client population?**
- **Does your organization/program get involved in incidents of intimate partner abuse directly and if so, what is your involvement?**

Review and Analysis of Public Domain Information

Measuring the cost of intimate partner abuse in Thompson presents a number of specific challenges. Most public sources of information about intimate partner abuse in Manitoba and across Canada provide aggregate data for large urban centres, not smaller cities such as Thompson. Further exacerbating this limitation is the difficulty in accurately distinguishing between intimate and stranger violence. For instance available data does not consistently define whether an assault is a domestic incident. RCMP, lawyers, justices of the peace, court, judges, remand centres, sheriffs, corrections and probations data can't be filtered by criminal code offense to segregate domestic violence data because the relationship between the accused and the victim does not define the criminal code violation.

Most of the data available identifies only criminal code offenses, and some include family violence across the life-span such as elder abuse, child abuse and neglect, and child sexual abuse. Studies on sexual assault typically include sexual assault by non-intimate partners. Another limiting factor is how data sources define domestic violence. For instance, psychological abuse is typically not a criminal code offense and doesn't come to the

attention of justice programs, even though survivors say emotional abuse drastically erodes their quality of life over extended periods of time.

There is also a lack of consistent and sufficient data collection and sorting by provincial and federal government programs from which to estimate the full cost of intimate partner abuse limiting this cost analysis to only the selected costs that could be quantified.

The estimate of the selected annual global costs of intimate partner violence in this survey were calculated using publicly available data, fee schedules, annual reports, audited financial statements, average annual professional salaries plus an additional 25% for employer costs and administrative overhead (hourly rates are based on an average of 2040 hours a year); and costs identified by stakeholders in Thompson during the consultation process. Pro-rated costs were applied to stakeholders' reports of the number of incidents, or based on assumptions extrapolated from other data. Annual costs are based on data from 2011, unless otherwise stated.

Consultation Findings



MAPS, as the chief provider of counseling services to men with abusive behaviors in Thompson can provide significant insight about intimate partner abuse. MAPS undertook a survey of 44 male clients in 2011, using an anti-oppression framework. These highlights reveal important information about men who have abusive behaviors toward their intimate partners.

Selected Results - MAPS Client Survey

- 66% identified as Aboriginal.
- 36% were full time-employees, 30% were unemployed, 9% said they were students, 7% said they were casual employees, 5% were homemakers, 2% were self-employed, 2% were unable to work and 9% chose other.
- 41% said they were living common-law, 18% were married, 16% claimed to be single, 14% were separated, 7% were divorced and 5% were dating.
- 36% said they had no involvement with Child and Family Services, 43% stated they were currently involved, 7% said they had been previously involved, 9% did not know, and 5% said it was not applicable.
- 64% said “no” they did not have a restraining order against them and 36% said “yes” they did have a restraining order against them.
- 30% said “yes” they had been convicted or they plead guilty to a domestic violence offense and 70% said “no”.
- 27% of the respondents said “yes” they were on probation for a domestic violence related conviction, and 73% said “no”.
- 30% of the respondents said “yes” they had been in breach of a court order related to domestic violence and 70% said “no”.
- 45% of the respondents said “yes”, they had been arrested for domestic violence and 55% said “no”.
- Of the 45% of respondents who said that they had been arrested for domestic violence, 38% said they had been arrested once for domestic violence, 38% said twice, and 24% said they had been arrested three times and 0% said they had been arrested four or more times.

Survey conducted with an anti-oppression framework therefore results do not add to 100%.

The results of this survey also provide information that can be used to extrapolate likely rates of intimate partner, the degree of involvement of the

criminal justice system, and men's commitment to change their abusive behaviors.

There is a commonly held belief that men with abusive behaviors only participate in counseling if they are mandated to do so by the courts. However, 55% of MAPS survey respondents had not been charged with a domestic violence related criminal code violation and 60% of men surveyed self-referred to MAPS.

MAPS clients were asked about their experience of childhood abuse. 56% of respondents said they had been physically abused, 64% said they had been emotionally abused, 22% said they had been sexually abused and 30% said they had been financially abused. Healing from childhood abuse is an essential component of counseling for men with abusive behaviors.

MAPS clients interviewed during the consultation process said that speedy access to counseling was a critical step in taking responsibility for their abusive behavior. Unfortunately, in 2011 the waiting list for men to access MAPS services ranged between 20 and 38 clients.

There is also a waiting list of 50 to see a family therapist at the Community Health Resource Action Centre (CHRAC) in Thompson. A therapist who works at the centre told the consultant that only five new client files can be opened a year. According to therapy service providers people who can't pay for private therapy, or access therapy through an Employee Assistance Program, could wait five to ten years to see a family therapist in Thompson.

The specific domestic violence service organizations in Thompson, MAPS and the Thompson Crisis Centre (TTC), provided information about rates and risks, severity and impact of intimate partner violence and shared their annual, financial and statistical reports with the consultant. This data was vital because these organizations are serving clients who may otherwise not be identified as domestic violence survivors or abusers when accessing other services or justice programs.

During the consultations, many of Thompson's other social service organizations identified that as many as 80% of their clients experience domestic violence and that between 20% and 40% of their staff time is spent providing services related to domestic violence.

During interviews service providers also said that many of their clients do not define forced sex in an intimate ongoing relationship as sexual assault and do not think that physiological abuse is domestic violence. This suggests that many survivors would not self-report being victims of intimate partner abuse.

The Burntwood Regional Health Authority (BRHA), 2009 Community Needs Assessment **reported 6.7% of mothers of newborn infants in the region were experiencing domestic violence**, compared to the provincial average of 2.5%. This is particularly significant because new mothers are very vulnerable, as are their infants.

No analysis of intimate partner abuse is complete without including dating violence. Dating violence is a significant problem for Thompson's youth. The *2010-2011 Youth Behavioral Survey* conducted by the School District of Mystery Lake, Burntwood Regional Health Authority (BRHA) and the Addictions Foundation of Manitoba in secondary schools reported the following alarming statistics for Thompson students enrolled in grades seven to 12:

- **21 % said that they had been physically assaulted or abused by a boyfriend/girlfriend or some-one they had dated.**
- **4% said that they had been sexually assaulted, 25% of sexual assaults were committed by a current or former boyfriend/girlfriend.**

TTC and the Futures Program provide healthy relationship workshops in some Thompson schools but they are woefully under resourced and these programs are not available to all high school grades. Unless adequately resourced programs are provided to youth, intimate partner abuse will continue to burden the community of Thompson into the next generation of adults and families.

All stakeholders who participated in the consultation process stressed the need for prevention and early intervention.

Global Costs



Thompson, Manitoba - Domestic Violence Resources and Facts

- RCMP - Thompson Detachment reported that they handled 176 cases of “strictly domestic violence” in 2011.
- A Crown prosecutor in Thompson reported an average domestic violence case load of 312 per year.
- A Legal Aid lawyer in Thompson reported an average domestic violence case load of 360 per year.
- Two, full-time Probation Officers in Thompson spend 50% of their time supervising approx. 200 convicted domestic violence offenders.
- Accused not released on bail are transported to The Pas: Remand Centre by Sheriffs.
- Offenders sentenced to incarceration are transported to Stoney Mountain, Federal Correctional facility or to Headingly Provincial Correctional Institute by two Sheriffs.
- Two justice workers with Manitoba Métis Federation, Justice Program provide treatment options for men who plead guilty as part of the Domestic Violence Treatment Court currently being piloted in Thompson.
- There are three Judges serving in Thompson courts.
- Justices of the Peace provide judicial services related to Protection Orders, Prevention Order and Peace Bonds.
- There are three, full-time Victims Service Workers in Thompson.
- Approximately 25% of criminal court cases in Thompson are for domestic violence offenses.

Annual Costs of Justice Interventions

Intervention/Service	Quantity	Cost
RCMP services	176 cases x 3 hours per incident x 2 officers. RCMP website - posted average salary of \$74,406 + 25% overhead = \$93,007.	\$48,145
Sheriffs	65 days of court. Salary source: Manitoba Justice Average salary \$46,360 + 25% = \$57,950.	\$14,487
Sheriffs -Transportation to remand/ provincial correctional facilities	786 kilometers x 19 trips x \$0.69 per Km.	\$10,304
	Salary and overhead costs for 10 hours per trip x 2 sheriffs x 19 trips.	\$10,792
	1,520 Km. x 19 trips x \$0.69 per Km. to provincial correctional facility.	\$19,927
	Salary and overhead costs for 18 hours per trip x 19 return x 2 sheriffs. Salary source: Manitoba Justice. Km. costs for sheriffs van.	\$19,430
Probation Services	2 half- time Probation Officer salaries + 25% overhead. Salary source: Manitoba Justice. Average salary \$51,713 + 25% overhead.	\$64,641
Judge	Provincial Court Judge x 65 days. Salary source: Statistics Canada. Average annual salary \$1,044 a day.	\$67,860
Incarceration costs	\$102,000 per offender per year x 11.44 cases. Corrections Canada 2010: Annual cost to maintain an offender in an institution. Estimate based on 13% of 176 x 50% of cases sentenced to a minimum of one year incarceration.	\$1,166,880

Men are Part of the Solution (MAPS)
 Domestic Violence in Northern Manitoba – A Cost Analysis, 2012

Intervention/Service	Quantity	Cost
Crown Council	25% of one full-time prosecutor. Salary source: Manitoba Association of Crown Attorneys: Collective Agreement 2011 = \$125,582 (does not include overhead).	\$31,395
Defense Council	33% of one full-time defense council. Salary source: Legal Aid Manitoba: mid-range lawyer salary = \$104,466 (does not include overhead).	\$34,473
Victims Services	25% of salary of 3 full-time Victims Support Workers + 25% overhead. Salary source: Manitoba Justice: Annual Report 2010/2011: average Victim Service Worker salary + 25% overhead = \$82,953.	\$62,215
TOTAL		\$1,550,549

Statistics Canada reports that 13% of domestic violence cases handled by the RCMP -Thompson Detachment in 2011, cases required hospital treatment and half of these cases result in a sentence of at least one year of incarceration.

Estimated Annual Health Costs

Health Service	Quantity	Cost
Emergency Department	\$2,000 average cost per visit 104 projected visits. Canadian Institute of Health: Cost of Acute Care in Canada 2004/2005. Statistic Canada: 13% of domestic violence victims require a hospital visit x 800 incidents.	\$208,000
Hospital Stay	\$7,000 average cost per hospital admission x 22.88 cases. Canadian Institute of Health. Cost of Acute Care in Canada 2004/2005 Stats Canada: 22% of 104 cases = 22.88 cases requiring hospitalization.	\$160,160
Family Physician Visits	\$31.85 for family physician per 15 minute visit x 472 visits. Manitoba Physician Fee Schedule 2011. Stats Canada: 59% of 800 victims visit a doctor at least once.	\$15,033
Mental Health - Counseling and Family Therapy	800 x 47% x 5 sessions x \$50.65 per session. Salary source: HRDC of \$64,212 + 25% overhead = \$80,264 (sessions based on average number of 1,580 per annum). Statistics Canada: 47% of victims sought psychologist/counselor services	\$95,222
Addictions Treatment sought as a result of intimate partner abuse	44% of 176 cases = 77 cases x \$40 a session x 12 sessions. 5% of 176 cases = 9 clients in residential treatment x \$175.00 a day x 28 days. AFM fee schedule for non-insured clients. 2004 General Social Survey: 44% of victims reported abuser was drinking at time of assault. 44% of 176 police cases x number of projected clients entering treatment seeking to reduce sentences rounded up to nine clients. Of the 176 police cases it has been assumed that a minimum of 5% will be mandated by the court to participate in residential treatment.	\$36,960 \$44,100
TOTAL		\$559,475

Domestic Violence Specific Services in Thompson

Thompson Crisis Centre provided:

- 5,576 shelter bed nights to 536 women and children.
- 1,569 crisis calls answered.
- 6,342 bed nights of Interim Housing to 252 women and children.
- 1,538 community members with 256 hours of outreach and public education.

12 month period between April 1, 2010 and March 31, 2011.

Men Are Part of the Solution:

- opened 38 new individual counseling cases.
- provided 1,208 hours of individual counseling.
- opened 30 new group counseling cases.
- provided 165 hours of group counseling.
- provided services to a total of 76 MAPS clients and 36 AFM clients.
- kept a current wait list of between 20 and 36 men.

Annual Costs for Domestic Violence Services in Thompson

Service	Source	Total Expenses
MAPS	Expenses from 2010/2011 Annual Report.	\$121,712
Thompson Crisis Centre	Expenses from 2010/2011 Annual Report + \$100,000 estimated cost for Manitoba Housing building.	\$900,000
TOTAL		\$1,021,712

Annual Cost Child and Family Services Costs

Service	Quantity	Cost
Assessment	4 hours of social worker @ \$47,529 + 25% overhead x 52 families.	\$6,262
Investigation	4 hours of social worker @ \$47,529 + 25% overhead x 41 families.	\$4,937
Apprehension	4 hours of social worker @ \$47,529 + 25% overhead x 20 families.	\$2,408
Children in Care	60 children in care @ average of \$800 a month per child for one year.	\$576,000
TOTAL		\$589,607

Salary estimates based on Manitoba Government Employees Union (MGEU) Master Agreement, mid-range salary \$47,529 + 25% overhead = \$61,411.

Estimate of hours for social workers provided by Child and Family Services, Manitoba.

The estimate of 52 cases is based on the assumption that Child and Family Services (CFS) will be called to the scene of a domestic dispute by RCMP in 50% of the 104 cases where hospital treatment for the survivor is required because the children have no one else to provide them with temporary care while the survivor seeks hospital treatment. The estimate of 41 investigations assumes that 25% of the 52 incidents where CFS are called to the scene result in concerns about the children's safety.

The estimate of 20 families where children are taken into care of CFS assumes an average of three children per family in care for the duration of their custodial parents' incarcerated for domestic violence related offenses.

Overall, women are two-and-a-half times as likely as men to report the most serious forms of violence. Survivors of intimate partner abuse, mostly women, would not seek services if they feared that their children would be apprehended. The vast majority of children who witness intimate partner abuse are not separated from their mothers as evidenced by the 487 children who accompanied their mothers into residential services at TCC between April 1, 2010 and March 31, 2011.

Researchers estimate that as many as 80% of children living in homes where there is domestic violence witness the abuse. Children impacted by domestic violence experience mental and physical health problems however; living in a home where intimate partner abuse is occurring does not automatically constitute child abuse or neglect.

Separating children from their parent/guardian because they have witnessed intimate partner abuse could cause more psychological harm to children and is punitive to the parent survivor. This is particularly true for Aboriginal families who are living with the legacy of forced family separation.

It should also be stressed that this estimate does not include the extremely high cost of Employment and Income Assistance provided to families when they are unable to work due to domestic violence, or the cost of investigations, apprehensions and care of children who have been abused and/or neglected.

Annual Cost of Other Social Services

Other Services	Quantity	Cost
Futures Program	50% of 1 full-time staff + 25% overhead per annum.	\$26,250
Boys and Girls Club	50% of 1 full-time staff + 25% overhead per annum.	\$26,250
YWCA	20% of 2 full-time staff + 25% overhead per annum.	\$21,000
Ma Mawi Tak Friendship Centre	25% of 1 full-time staff + 25% overhead per annum.	\$13,125
Thompson Homeless Shelter	50% of 2 full-time staff + 25% overhead per annum.	\$52,500
TOTAL		\$139,125

Salary estimates are based on MGEU Master Agreement: Community and Social Service Worker, mid-range salary of \$42,000+ 25% overhead = \$52,500.
 Estimates of staff time based on stakeholder information provided to consultant.

Education Resources for Intimate Partner Abuse in Thompson

- YWCA, Steps to Success Program reports that as many as 40% of their adult education clients say the reason they did not complete high school was domestic violence in their homes as children.
- The School Division of Mystery Lake employs 3 full-time psychologists/counselors.
- 21% of grade 8 to 12 students experience dating violence and 4% has been sexually assaulted.
- 22% of students are likely to witness domestic violence at home.
- The School Division of Mystery Lake operates a ½ time satellite school program at the Thompson Crisis Centre.

Annual Estimate of Education Costs

Education Service	Quantity	Cost
YWCA – Steps to Success Program	35% of salary and overhead for 2 adult education staff.	\$36,750
Mystery Lake School Division Counselors	21% of cost of 3 professional staff for school psychology services.	\$51,187
TTC Satellite school program	Half-time teacher salary + 25% overhead.	\$41,243
TOTAL		\$129,180

Salary estimates are based on average Community and Social Service Worker salary of \$42,000 + 25% overhead.
 Estimates of staff time based on stakeholder information provided to consultant.
 Hourly salary and overhead cost based on 2040 average number of working hours a year.
 School Psychologist/Counselor salary based on Canadian average of \$65,000 per annum + 25% overhead = \$81,250.
 The percentage of time school counselors spend on issues related to intimate partner abuse, including students dating relationships is estimated as 21% to correlate with the percentage of Thompson high school students reporting dating violence.
 Teacher salary based on Manitoba Teachers Association - Collective Agreement - at mid-range of salary = \$65,989 x 25% overhead = \$82,486.

Scenarios – Costs Add-up



The scenarios presented here itemize individual incident costs of the probable range of community, government and service responses and illustrate a range of interventions. These estimates are based on the pro-rated estimates of the global costs. The first scenario is a high-cost, high-intensity intervention. The second scenario is an early intervention, treatment focused intervention.

Scenario One - Shelley and Steve

Steve and Shelley are common-law partners who live in rental accommodation in the city of Thompson. Shelley has three children, aged 13, eight and three. The adults are common law partners and the children are the biological children of the mother but not the step-father.

The family lives on Employment and Income Assistance and has some involvement with Child and Family Services related to parenting supports.

RCMP receive a call from the 13 year-old boy who reports that his step-dad is “hitting and pushing” his mom. He says he is at home with his brother and baby sister.

Two RCMP officers attend at the family home at about 23:45 on September 14, 2011. Shelley tells the two officers in attendance that her common law partner, Steve has been shoving her and slapped her in the face. She says she was pushed by Steve and fell on the edge of the coffee table.

Police note that she has a head wound which is bleeding profusely. Shelley is very distraught and has abrasive injuries on her face. She says she is scared and wants the police to take Steve off the premise. The three children are at home at the time.

The officers call an ambulance and Shelley is taken to the hospital. As she is being transported into the ambulance police tell her that they are arresting Steve and ask her if she has family who can care for the three children. Shelley says she doesn't know anyone who can pick-up the children. The police tell her that they will have to call Child and Family Services to come and take the children somewhere safe.

Steve, who has a record of prior assault of his former intimate partner, is arrested and charged with *assault causing bodily harm*. He appears in

court the following morning and enters into a recognizance with a number of conditions; including: to appear in court when required to do so, have no contact with Shelly or the children, and not to attend at their home, school, work or place of worship.

Shelley is admitted to hospital for observation for concussion and treated for her facial lacerations and other injuries. The on-call Social Worker at the hospital tells Shelley to call Victim's Services so that she knows whether Steve has been charged, his whereabouts and the outcome of his first appearance in court. Shelley is told that Steve has been released on bail and the conditions of his release are explained.

After Shelley is discharged from hospital (50 hours after admission) she takes a taxi to her friend's home in Thompson. Shelley immediately contacts Children and Family Services to enquire about the whereabouts of her children, who have been placed in temporary foster care.

Child and Family Services Family Services have conducted an assessment and determined that the children are not at risk of abuse or neglect by Shelley and that the children can be returned to her as soon as she has secured suitable accommodation.

Shelley calls the Thompson Crisis Centre (TCC) and asks if she can bring her three children and stay "in shelter". Shelley, who does not have any personal belongings for herself or the children, is admitted to shelter.

Shelley, concerned that she will bump into Steve somewhere in Thompson and that he will retaliate for his arrest obtains a Protection Order. The Protection Order provides her with a police escort to the apartment to pick-up a few personal belonging.

Shelley and her three children stay at TTC's shelter for 30 days. The apartment is no longer affordable without Steve's portion of the rent, so Shelley and her children are transferred into TTC's Interim Housing Program, where they live for five months. During this time Shelley applies for a Manitoba Housing unit. Manitoba Housing considers her application a priority and she is offered a unit six months after the incident.

Shelley has received a damage deposit and community start-up grant from Employment and Income Assistance in the past and is not eligible for assistance with furnishing and equipping a new family home. Shelley approaches numerous social services organizations for donations of furniture.

Steve's trial is set eight months after the incident, during which time he attends MAPS groups and individual counseling which he hopes will help reduce his sentence if he is convicted. Steve pleads "*Not Guilty*". Shelley, who has been subpoenaed to give testimony, receives support from Victim's Services. During the trial the arresting officers and Shelley give testimony. Steve is found guilty of *assault causing bodily harm* and sentenced to six months in a provincial correctional facility and twelve months of supervised probation. Steve is transported to Headingly Correctional Institute by two sheriffs where he serves his full sentence.

Shelley now wants to secure long-term independence but is not able to secure employment because she does not have the required essential skills. She registers at YWCA Assessment Centre for essential skills assessment and enrolls for Essential Skills training. Shelley left home and school at the age of 15 because of violence at home.

Shelley's two school-aged children appear to be falling behind in learning outcomes for their ages and she believes that some of this can be attributed to the impact of domestic violence. Shelley's two year-old child also cries a lot and appears very unsettled.

Shelley is suffering from anxiety and depression while trying to cope with the stress, disruption, and emotional impact of the abuse as well as the pressure of sole parenting during the long road of re-building her life. She visits a family physician and is prescribed anti-depressants. She also seeks counseling with the Community Health Action Resource Centre's therapist and takes her children to family therapy sessions. Shelley also finds it very helpful to visit the Aboriginal Outreach Worker at the Community Health Action Centre to gain spiritual strength during her journey of healing.

Shelley attends the family and parenting programs at the Futures Program in Thompson at least three times a week, and her older children participate in programming with the Boys and Girls Club.

A year after the incident Shelley begins to feel less isolated and more hopeful about the future. After his release, Steve returns to his home community of Oxford House.

Scenario One Costs

Steve	Intervention/Service	Quantity of Service	Estimate
	Police attendance at scene, arrest and processing	\$45.60 an hour x 4 hours x 2 officers.	\$3,648
	Over-night in custody	% of Sheriffs time.	\$227
	1 st court appearance, trial and sentencing	Judge for equivalent to one day of court.	\$1,044
	Crown Council Prosecutor	\$125,582 per annum x 4 hours.	\$246
	Legal Aid Staff Lawyer	\$100,466 per annum x 4 hours.	\$197
	Transportation to Headingly Correctional Centre	Return trip Thompson to Headingly at \$0.69c per Km. 2 sheriffs X 16 hours.	\$1,048 \$909
	6 months in custody	\$280.00 x 178 days.	\$49,840
	12 months of probation supervision in community	Probation supervision one hour a week for 52 weeks.	\$1,648
	Participation in MAPS group and individual counseling	12 weeks of groups counseling and 18 hours of individual counseling.	\$4,050
TOTAL			\$62,857

Men are Part of the Solution (MAPS)
 Domestic Violence in Northern Manitoba – A Cost Analysis, 2012

Shelley	Intervention/Service	Quantity of Service	Estimate
	Ambulance	1 inner city trip with stretcher service.	\$360
	Hospital Treatment	Average cost of emergency room visit and hospitalization.	\$7,000
	Child and Family Service attendance at scene and assessment.	4 hours of Social Worker salary + overhead.	\$120
	Foster care for 3 children for 3 nights	Average foster care costs = \$27.00 a night per child.	\$243
	30 day shelter stay for Shelley and 3 children (includes daily one-hour counseling sessions x 4)	30 day stay @ per person average cost.	\$12,588
	Interim Housing for five months for Shelley and 3 children (includes counseling)	450 bed nights @ average per person cost.	\$16,587
	Children's schooling at TCC while in shelter	20 half days of teacher's salary and overhead – pro-rated to 33% of enrollment.	\$1,067
	YWCA - Assessment Centre and STEPS	Average per person cost.	\$2,000
	School psychologist/ counseling costs	\$51.42 per session x 2 children x 26 sessions.	\$2,674
	Family physician visits for Shelley and 9 visits for each child	\$31.85 x 39 visits.	\$1,242

Shelley	Intervention/Service	Quantity of Service	Estimate
	Participation in Futures Program	20% of one staff salary + 25% overhead.	\$10,500
	Two older children enrolled in the Boys and Girls Club for one year	% of programming costs for evenings and occasional week-end activities.	\$10,500
	Family Therapy	Bi-weekly one-hour therapy for one-year x \$50.65 a session.	\$1,317
	Aboriginal outreach support	Bi-weekly one-hour therapy for one-year.	\$946
TOTAL			\$67,114

- This incident is estimated to cost a minimum of \$130,001.
- If all of the 176 cases that came to the attention of the RCMP - Thompson Detachment in 2011 consumed similar resources the cost would be a staggering **\$22,880,176**.

Scenario Two Costs - Kate and Kevin

Kevin and Kate are married and live in a house they own in Thompson with their 12 year-old son, Kelley. Their relationship is fraught with conflict and there have been many verbal altercations between them. On December 15, 2011, they are shouting and arguing on the front porch. Kevin is yelling in Kate's face while she is backed against a wall. Kate, in an effort to stop the confrontation, kicks Kevin who falls. A neighbor calls the police.

Two police officers attend at the scene and Kevin tells them that Kate assaulted him. Kate says it was self-defense. Police arrest Kate and charge her with *assault*. Police release her the following morning on the conditions that she appears in court when required to do so, have no contact with Kevin, and not attend at his home, school, work or place of worship. On her release Kate rents a room at the YWCA.

Meanwhile Kevin who had not realized that Kate would not be back home after her release, decides that he is not going to be a witness should Kate's case go to trial. Kevin calls the RCMP and says he will not give testimony at Kate's trial.

At her first appearance in court the Crown Prosecutor's position is that Kate should be stayed for counseling. The judge orders Kate into counseling. If Kate completes the required counseling the Crown Prosecutor will drop the charges.

Meanwhile, Kevin who feels sorry about the argument now believes that Kate was just trying to get away from his "yelling" contacts Kate and asks her to return home. The couple decides that they both need counseling and that Kelley would also benefit from counseling.

Kate enrolls in counseling with the Manitoba Metis Federation Justice Program to comply with the court's order and Kevin and Kate sign onto the waiting list for family therapy at the Community Health Action Resource Centre. Kevin recognizes that his drinking is contributing to his abusive pattern of controlling Kate and registers for treatment with the Addiction Foundation of Manitoba (AFM). Kate and Kevin also seek therapy from the family therapist at AFM in Thompson. Kevin is admitted into the 28-day residential treatment program and completes the treatment.

Both Kate and Kevin visit their family doctor at least 12 times each for issues related to depression, anxiety and stress and Kevin seeks the assistance of MAPS and participates in individual and group counseling. Kate and Kevin seeing the negative impact of their relationship on Kelley find him therapy serves which he receives every other week for a year.

The charges against Kate are dropped and the family tells their therapists that their relationship is improving and they are grateful that they have received help.

Scenario Two Costs

Kate	Intervention/Service	Quantity of Service	Estimate
	2 police officer's attendance at scene, arrest and processing	\$45.60 @ hour x 4 hours x 2 officers.	\$365
	Over-night in custody	% of guard time.	\$227
	1 st court appearance	Judge etc.	\$250
	Crown Council Prosecutor	\$125,582 per annum x 2 hours.	\$123
	YWCA room	Single night rate x 7 nights.	\$550
	Counseling with Manitoba Metis Federation - Justice Program	12 weeks of group and 18 hours of individual counseling.	\$2,431
	Family physician visits for depression	12 visits @ \$31.85 a visit.	\$382
	Individual counseling with family therapists	26 one-hour therapy sessions x \$50.65 per session.	\$1,317
TOTAL			\$5,645

Kevin	Intervention/Service	Quantity of Service	Estimate
	Individual and Family Therapists	26 one-hour therapy sessions @ \$50.65 per session.	\$1,317
	Addictions Treatment	28 day residential treatment and 26 individual sessions.	\$4,900
	Participation in MAPS	12 weeks of group and 18 hours of individual counseling @ average cost per client.	\$3,546
	Kelley's Psychologist	One-hour sessions x 26 @ \$50.65 per session.	\$1,317
	Family Physician	12 visit @ \$31.85 a visit.	\$382
TOTAL			\$11,462

- This incident is estimated to cost a minimum of \$17,107.
- If all of the 176 cases that came to the attention of the RCMP-Thompson Detachment in 2011 consumed similar resources the cost would be **\$3,010,832**.

“Without help, abusive relationships only get worse”: Manitoba’s Domestic Violence Awareness Campaign tells Manitobans every year. When abusers take personal responsibility for their abusive behavior and seek the treatment they need the outcome reduces danger to survivors and their children.

Unfortunately the Kate and Kevin scenario would not be possible with the current level of services for men with abusive behaviors in Thompson. Without an investment in prevention; and timely intervention and treatment programs for abusers, the number of high-intensity, high-cost interventions will continue to escalate. It is not a question of whether we can afford prevention and early intervention. The decision to be made is do we pay now, or do we pay later?

References



Public Domain Research

- Canadian Centre for Justice. *Criminal Harassment in Canada*. Ottawa, Canada, 2003.
- Canadian Centre for Justice. *Police-reported Crime Statistics for Selected Offenses 2009/2010*. Ottawa, Canada 2010.
- Canadian Institute of Health. *Cost of Acute Care in Canada 2004/2005*. Ottawa Canada, 2005.
- Corrections Services Canada. *Federal Sentences -Statistics, Key Facts and Figures 2006-2007*. Ottawa, Canada, 2007.
- Department of Justice. *Family Violence: An Overview Paper 2009*. Ottawa, Canada 2009.
- Northern and Indian Affairs. *Aboriginal Women and Family Violence*. Ottawa, Canada, 2008.
- Statistics Canada. *Family Violence in Canada: A Statistical Profile 2010*. Ottawa, Canada, 2011.
- Statistics Canada. *Homicides in Canada 2010*. Ottawa, Canada, 2011.
- Statistics Canada. *Self-reported Victimization Survey 2010*. Ottawa, Canada, 2011
- Statistics Canada. *Uniform Crime Reporting Incident-Based Survey 2010*. Ottawa, Canada. 2011.
- Statistics Canada. *Victims Services in Canada. National, Provincial and Territorial, Manitoba Fact Sheet – 2009/2010*. Ottawa, Canada. 2011.
- Statistics Canada. *Violent Victimization of Aboriginal Women in Canadian Provinces, 2009*, Ottawa, Canada. 2010.

Published Studies

- Australian Domestic and Family Violence Clearinghouse: *Australian Studies of the Economic Costs of Domestic Violence*. Australia, 2001.
- Campbell, M., Neil, J.A., Jaffe, P.G. & Kelly, T. *Engaging abusive men in seeking community intervention: A critical research & practice priority*. Journal of Family Violence, 25, (4), Canada. (2010).
- Canadian Centre for Research on Violence Against Women and Children: *Selected Estimates of the Costs of Violence Against Women*. Ottawa, Canada, 1995.
- European Council, Human Rights: Section - Equality Between Women and Men. *Male Violence: the economic cost - A Methodological Review*. Strasbourg, France, 1999.
- Ministry of Women's Equality, Province of British Columbia: *Paying for Violence: Some of the Costs of Violence Against Women in B.C.*. Victoria, British Columbia, 1996.
- Minnesota Department of Health: *Cost of Sexual Violence in Minnesota*, Minnesota, 2007.
- World Health Organization: *The Economic Dimensions of Interpersonal Violence*. Geneva, Switzerland, 2004.

Various Reports

Burntwood Regional Health Authority. *2009 Community Needs Assessment, 2010/2011 Annual Report.*

City of Thompson: *2010 Annual Report, Consolidated Financial Statements 2010, Annual Fee and Fine Schedule.*

Legal Aid Manitoba. *2010/2011 Fees in Criminal Matters, Manitoba.*

Legal Aid Manitoba. *2010/2011 Annual Report, Manitoba.*

Manitoba Family Services and Consumer Affairs. *2010/2011 Annual Report.*

Manitoba Health. *Health Physician's Manual of Fees. 2012. Manitoba, 2012.*

Manitoba Justice: *2010/2011 Annual Report.*

MAPS: *2010/2011 Client Survey Report, 2011/2012 Annual Statistical Reports, 2010/2011 Audited Financial Statements.*

Marymound, Futures Program. *2011 Statistical Reports, 2010/2011 Annual Report.*

Mystery Lake School District. *2010/2011 Annual Report.*

Mystery Lake School District, Burntwood Regional Health Authority and Addictions Foundation of Manitoba. *Youth Behavior Survey 2010-2011.*

Thompson Crisis Centre. *2010/2011 Audited Financial Statements, 2010/2011 Annual Report, 2011/2012 Statistical Reports.*

Thompson Domestic Violence Court Committee. *2007 Report to the Government of Manitoba.*

Thompson Neighborhood Renewal Corporation. *Women: Economic Development and Re-structuring in Thompson (Draft Report), Thompson, Manitoba, 2012.*